



# Clackmannanshire Council Area and Perth and Kinross Council Area

## Introduction

1. Clackmannanshire Council area is currently contained wholly within Ochil county constituency and its electorate constitutes approximately 64 per cent of the electorate in that constituency. The remainder of Ochil constituency comprises parts of Perth and Kinross and Stirling Council areas. Perth and Kinross Council area is currently contained in 3 county constituencies. Perth constituency lies wholly within Perth and Kinross Council area and contains approximately 58 per cent of that Council's electorate. North Tayside constituency comprises part of Perth and Kinross Council area and part of Angus Council area, the electorate of the former constituting approximately 54 per cent of the total in that constituency. Angus county constituency also includes part of Perth and Kinross Council area, the electorate of the latter accounting for approximately 4 per cent of the total for the constituency. The electorates of these constituencies at the start and finish of the previous and current reviews are provided at Appendix C.

## Initial Considerations

2. In forming our initial proposals for Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area we had in mind the following considerations:

2.1 At the enumeration date of June 2001, Clackmannanshire Council area contained 36,595 parliamentary electors, giving the Council area a theoretical entitlement of 0.5 seats.

2.2 At the enumeration date of June 2001, Perth and Kinross Council area contained 105,861 parliamentary electors, giving the Council area a theoretical entitlement of 1.5 seats.

2.3 The combined parliamentary electorate for the Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area was 142,456, giving a theoretical entitlement of 2.04 seats.

3. We examined the present arrangements whereby all of Clackmannanshire Council area and part of Perth and Kinross Council area are associated with the adjoining Council areas of Angus, Dundee City and Stirling for the purposes of parliamentary representation. This situation resulted in a small group of constituencies straddling the boundaries of 5 Council areas, and had arisen as a result of the restructuring of local authorities in 1996. Given the

increase in the electoral quota and the requirement to take council boundaries into consideration, we concluded that it would not be possible or desirable to maintain these existing constituency arrangements. However, we noted that the combined electorates of Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area now allowed the formulation of provisional recommendations for 2 revised county constituencies that would very closely approximate to the electoral quota. Accordingly, we decided that the combined area should be allocated 2 constituencies.

4. We noted that part of Perth and Kinross Council area, which largely comprises Kinross, was already associated with part of Clackmannanshire Council area in the existing Ochil constituency. We further noted that, prior to the Fourth Periodical Review, Kinross had been associated with an area lying to the west and north of Perth stretching as far as Loch Earn in the west and Logiealmond in the north.

5. In formulating our provisional proposals, we decided that combining Perth and Kinross Council area wards 11-13, 15 and 34-41 with all of the wards within Clackmannanshire Council area would form a suitable constituency of approximately 68,933 electors. We also decided that the remainder of Perth and Kinross Council area, comprising wards 1-10, 14 and 16-33, should form a single constituency of 73,523 electors.

### Provisional Proposals

6. On 7 February 2002 we published our provisional proposals for 2 county constituencies for the combined Council areas of Clackmannanshire and Perth and Kinross as follows:

Constituencies	Comprising	Electorate (June 2001)
Strathearn and Ochil CC	Electoral wards in Clackmannanshire Council area	
	1 Menstrie	1,713
	2 Alva North	2,106
	3 Alva South	1,985
	4 Tillicoultry West	2,046
	5 Tillicoultry East	2,054
	6 Dollar and Muckhart	2,080
	7 Devon and Clackmannan North	2,404
	8 Clackmannan	2,186
	9 Gartmorn	2,314
	10 Alloa North	2,199
	11 Alloa East	1,830
	12 Alloa Mar	1,661
	13 Alloa West	1,801
	14 Alloa Claremont	1,901
	15 Fairfield	1,995
	16 Muirside	2,370
	17 St Serf's	1,948
18 Delph and Cambus	2,002	

## Electoral wards in Perth and Kinross Council area

11	Comrie	2,342
12	Crieff North	2,801
13	Crieff South	2,611
15	Strathalmond	2,593
34	Earn	2,625
35	Auchterarder Mid Earn	2,668
36	Strathallan and Glendevon	2,942
37	Auchterarder Craig Rossie	2,712
38	Abernethy and Glenfarg	2,336
39	Milnathort and North Kinross	2,946
40	Kinross Town	2,783
41	Kinross-shire	2,979
	Total	68,933

## Perth and Atholl CC

## Electoral wards in Perth and Kinross Council area

1	Rannoch and Atholl	1,458
2	Pitlochry	2,503
3	Ratray and Glenshee	2,633
4	Alyth and Old Ratray	2,742
5	Coupar Angus and Meigle	2,702
6	Rosemount	2,483
7	Blairgowrie	2,368
8	Kinclaven and Clunie	2,549
9	Strathtay and Dunkeld	2,490
10	Breadalbane	2,487
14	Strathord and Logiealmond	2,805
16	Scone	2,685
17	Dunsinnan	2,522
18	East Carse	2,665
19	Central Carse	2,477
20	Barnhill and West Carse	2,560
21	Pictstonhill	2,493
22	North Inch	2,277
23	Muirton	2,197
24	North Muirton	2,685
25	Hillyland	2,638
26	Ruthven Park	2,571
27	North Letham	2,512
28	South Letham	2,792
29	Wellshill	2,546
30	Oakbank	2,542
31	Craigie	2,815
32	South Inch	2,689
33	Moncreiffe and Friarton	2,637
	Total	73,523

## **Representations on Provisional Proposals**

7. During the statutory consultation period, we received 10 representations, including 2 petitions with a total of approximately 260 names, regarding our provisional proposals. Most objections focused on the following issues:

7.1 Whether Clackmannanshire Council area should be paired with Perth and Kinross Council area.

7.2 Whether Perth and Kinross Council area ward 14 (Strathord and Logiealmond) should be transferred to the proposed Strathearn and Ochil constituency.

## **Local Inquiry**

8. As a consequence of the objection to our proposals from Perth and Kinross Council, as well as the number of electors objecting, we recognised that we had a statutory duty to hold a local inquiry. Some representations made in respect of our provisional proposals for Dundee City Council area suggested the transfer of Perth and Kinross Council area ward 18 (East Carse) into a constituency largely comprising part of Dundee City Council area. We therefore decided to hold an inquiry which covered the 4 Council areas of Angus, Dundee City, Clackmannanshire and Perth and Kinross. At our request you agreed to appoint Sheriff Principal R A Dunlop QC, Sheriff Principal of Tayside, Central and Fife, as Assistant Commissioner at the inquiry into our provisional proposals. The inquiry was held in Perth City Hall on 29 and 30 October 2002, and in the City Chambers, Dundee on 31 October and 1 November 2002.

9. In the period up to the start of the local inquiry, the number of representations received increased to 12. All the representations were seen by the Assistant Commissioner and copies were made available at the inquiry.

10. Following the inquiry, a verbatim transcript of the proceedings and the Assistant Commissioner's Report were made available on our web site.

## **Assistant Commissioner's Report and Recommendations**

11. The Assistant Commissioner first considered the statutory framework within which the Boundary Commission is required to operate. He noted that, with the application of the electoral quota for England, the constituency landscape would change dramatically. He considered that Rules 4 and 5 should be read together. Thus, one may take a single local authority as a starting point but if there is an excessive disparity between the electorate of any constituency and the electoral quota, it may be necessary to combine local authority areas so as to avoid that disparity. The Assistant Commissioner also expressed the view that the general thrust of the Rules was to encourage the Commission to limit the extent to which the boundaries between council areas are crossed. He noted that this approach seemed to accord with our statement that we would make every effort to keep to a minimum proposals for constituencies that cross local authority boundaries.

12. The Assistant Commissioner was not persuaded by proposals advanced at the inquiry by Dundee City Council, the Scottish Labour Party and others regarding Perth and Kinross ward 18 (East Carse) which would, if accepted, have placed that ward in the Dundee West constituency. In considering the evidence offered by Perth and Kinross Council, he reached the view that the acceptance of these proposals would have adverse consequences for constituency design in Perth and Kinross Council area. He also expressed the view that, although there was a barrier created by the Ochil Hills, it was not an absolute one. Since Clackmannanshire and Kinross were already linked in the Ochil constituency and Kinross was part of Perth and Kinross Council area, he concluded that our proposal to combine these local authorities provided the best fit in terms of compliance with the Rules.

13. The Assistant Commissioner considered the evidence regarding ward 14 (Strathord and Logiealmond) and concluded that there was a compelling case that this ward would be better associated with ward 13 (Crieff South), ward 15 (Strathalmond) and ward 35 (Auchterarder Mid Earn) in the proposed Strathearn and Ochil constituency. He noted that, at the inquiry, there was no objection to the proposed transfer. He further noted that a significant number of written representations from local people in these wards supported the proposed transfer and that the support did not discriminate between different parts of ward 14. His opinion was reinforced by the view of the Perth and Kinross Council representative that the proposed change would not be of particular concern to the Council.

14. The Assistant Commissioner noted there was general agreement that “Strathearn” was not a good description of the Perth and Kinross Council area wards in the proposed Strathearn and Ochil constituency; electors in Clackmannanshire would not have a good appreciation of which areas fell within that description, whereas they did have a good understanding of “Perthshire”. He also noted that Kinross and Clackmannanshire are both represented in the name of the existing Ochil constituency and that there was no evidence from these areas to suggest dissatisfaction with that name. Consequently, he recommended that the name “Ochil and South Perthshire” be adopted in place of “Strathearn and Ochil”. Similarly, the Assistant Commissioner noted that “Atholl” was not an accurate description of the geographical area of the proposed Perth and Atholl constituency outwith the town of Perth. Perth and Kinross Council suggested “Perth and North Perthshire”, which could properly be applied to describe the area. Accordingly, the Assistant Commissioner recommended that this name be adopted.

### **Consideration of the Assistant Commissioner’s Report and Recommendations**

15. We noted that the Assistant Commissioner agreed with our decision to combine Clackmannanshire Council area with Perth and Kinross Council area to allow the design of 2 constituencies.

16. We also accepted the Assistant Commissioner’s view that a strong case had been made for including ward 14 (Strathord and Logiealmond) in our proposed Strathearn and Ochil constituency and we agreed to amend our provisional proposals accordingly.

17. We considered that the Assistant Commissioner’s recommendations regarding the names of proposed constituencies more accurately reflected the geography of the areas

concerned. Accordingly, we agreed that the revised Strathearn and Ochil constituency should be renamed “Ochil and South Perthshire” and that the revised Perth and Atholl constituency should be renamed “Perth and North Perthshire”.

### Publication of Revised Recommendations

18. On 26 June 2003 we published a notice stating that, having considered the Assistant Commissioner’s Report, we had decided to revise our proposals for parliamentary constituencies in Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area by incorporating all of the recommendations made by the Assistant Commissioner in respect of these areas. The revised recommendations for Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area were:

Constituencies	Comprising	Electorate (June 2001)
Ochil and South Perthshire CC	Electoral wards in Clackmannanshire Council area	
	1 Menstrie	1,713
	2 Alva North	2,106
	3 Alva South	1,985
	4 Tillicoultry West	2,046
	5 Tillicoultry East	2,054
	6 Dollar and Muckhart	2,080
	7 Devon and Clackmannan North	2,404
	8 Clackmannan	2,186
	9 Gartmorn	2,314
	10 Alloa North	2,199
	11 Alloa East	1,830
	12 Alloa Mar	1,661
	13 Alloa West	1,801
	14 Alloa Claremont	1,901
	15 Fairfield	1,995
	16 Muirside	2,370
	17 St Serf’s	1,948
	18 Delph and Cambus	2,002
	Electoral wards in Perth and Kinross Council area	
	11 Comrie	2,342
	12 Crieff North	2,801
	13 Crieff South	2,611
	14 Strathord and Logiealmond	2,805
	15 Strathalmond	2,593
	34 Earn	2,625
	35 Auchterarder Mid Earn	2,668
	36 Strathallan and Glendevon	2,942

37	Auchterarder Craig Rossie	2,712
38	Abernethy and Glenfarg	2,336
39	Milnathort and North Kinross	2,946
40	Kinross Town	2,783
41	Kinross-shire	2,979
	Total	71,738

Perth and North  
Perthshire CC

Electoral wards in Perth and Kinross  
Council area

1	Rannoch and Atholl	1,458
2	Pitlochry	2,503
3	Ratray and Glenshee	2,633
4	Alyth and Old Ratray	2,742
5	Coupar Angus and Meigle	2,702
6	Rosemount	2,483
7	Blairstown	2,368
8	Kinclaven and Clunie	2,549
9	Strathay and Dunkeld	2,490
10	Breadalbane	2,487
16	Scone	2,685
17	Dunsinnan	2,522
18	East Carse	2,665
19	Central Carse	2,477
20	Barnhill and West Carse	2,560
21	Pictstonhill	2,493
22	North Inch	2,277
23	Muirton	2,197
24	North Muirton	2,685
25	Hillyland	2,638
26	Ruthven Park	2,571
27	North Letham	2,512
28	South Letham	2,792
29	Wellshill	2,546
30	Oakbank	2,542
31	Craigie	2,815
32	South Inch	2,689
33	Moncreiffe and Friarton	2,637
	Total	70,718

### Representations on Revised Recommendations

19. Following the publication of our revised recommendations, we received 18 representations. Some representations remarked on more than one aspect of our revised recommendations. The representations fell broadly into the following categories:

19.1 Nine representations supported the transfer of Perth and Kinross Council area ward 14 (Strathord and Logiealmond) from Perth and North Perthshire to Ochil and South Perthshire.

19.2 Eight representations objected to the transfer of Perth and Kinross Council area ward 14 (Strathord and Logiealmond) from Perth and North Perthshire to Ochil and South Perthshire.

19.3 Seven representations related to the revised constituency names.

20. The representations which objected to the location of Perth and Kinross Council area ward 14 (Strathord and Logiealmond) in Ochil and South Perthshire were principally concerned that the villages located in the east of the ward had closer ties to east Perthshire and the town of Perth. Perth and Kinross Council proposed that ward 14 should be divided between the 2 proposed constituencies.

21. We considered the proposal for the division of ward 14 but our policy, which is widely accepted, is that whole wards should form the building blocks for revised constituencies. We were, therefore, not persuaded to divide ward 14 between the proposed constituencies.

22. We noted that, in his Inquiry Report, the Assistant Commissioner mentioned that the villages located in the east of ward 14 might not have close ties with wards 13 and 35 but that no representations were received from these settlements. We further noted that the representative from Perth and Kinross Council expressed the view at the inquiry that the Council would not be particularly concerned if ward 14 was placed in Ochil and South Perthshire constituency.

23. Nevertheless, in light of the representations received about our revised recommendations for ward 14, we reviewed all of the representations and reconsidered the Inquiry Report recommendation, but we were not persuaded to amend our revised recommendations.

24. Of the 7 representations relating to revised constituency names, 5 offered support for the changes and two suggested an alternative to "Ochil". We were not persuaded to amend the revised constituency names.

### **Final Recommendations**

25. On 11 December 2003 we announced that we were making no further changes to our proposals for 2 county constituencies covering Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area and that these were to be our final recommendations.

26. We accordingly recommend the adoption of our proposals for 2 county constituencies covering Clackmannanshire Council area and Perth and Kinross Council area, as set out in paragraph 18 above.

